

Governing Digitally Integrated Genetic Resources, Data, and Literature

Global Intellectual Property Strategies for a Redesigned Microbial Research Commons

JEROME H. REICHMAN

Duke University School of Law

PAUL F. UHLIR

National Academy of Sciences

TOM DEDEURWAERDERE

Catholic University, Leuven



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473, USA

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107021747

© Jerome H. Reichman, Paul F. Uhlir and Tom Dedeurwaerdere 2015

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2015

Printed in the United States of America

A catalog record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Reichman, J. H. (Jerome H.), 1936-, author.

Governing digitally integrated genetic resources, data, and literature: global intellectual property strategies for a redesigned microbial research commons / Jerome H. Reichman, Paul F. Uhlir, Tom Dedeurwaerdere.

p. ; cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-107-02174-7 (hardback)

I. Uhlir, P. F. (Paul F.), 1954-, author. II. Dedeurwaerdere, Tom, author. III. Title.

[DNLM: 1. Genetics--legislation & jurisprudence. 2. Access to Information.

3. Intellectual Property. 4. Internationality. 5. Research. QU33.1]

QH442

572.8--dc23

2015003104

ISBN 978-1-107-02174-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party Internet Web sites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such Web sites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	<i>page xvii</i>
1 Uncertain Legal Status of Microbial Genetic Resources in a Conflicted Geopolitical Environment	1
I. Introduction	1
II. The Changing Nature of Microbial Research	7
A. The “Wet Lab” Era	8
B. The Revolution in Genetic Science	10
C. Cutting-Edge Applications of Microbial Science in Response to Major Global Challenges	13
1. <i>Improving Human Health and Mitigating Pandemics</i>	14
2. <i>Enhancing Agricultural Production and Food Security</i>	16
3. <i>Protecting the Natural Environment and Conserving Biodiversity</i>	17
4. <i>Addressing the Energy Challenge by Producing Biofuels</i>	18
D. A New Research Paradigm for the Life Sciences	19
III. Limits of the Emerging Movement to Digitally Integrate Research Inputs into the “New Biology”	22
A. Recognizing Institutional and Legal Challenges to the Existing Microbial Research Infrastructure	23
B. Towards a Redesigned Microbial Research Commons	27
 PART ONE INTERNATIONAL REGULATION OF GENETIC RESOURCES AND THE ASSAULT ON SCIENTIFIC RESEARCH	
2 Between Private and Public Goods: Emergence of the Transnational Research Commons for Plant and Microbial Genetic Resources	37

I.	Historical Importance of Genetic Resources as Global Public Goods	37
A.	Dependence of Wet-Lab Microbiology on Cross-Border Exchanges of Validated Reference Strains from Public Culture Collections	38
	1. <i>Formation of an International Consortium of Public Service Microbial Culture Collections</i>	39
	2. <i>An Ancillary Research Commons for Influenza Viruses</i>	44
B.	Early Efforts to Form an Agricultural Research Commons for Plant Genetic Resources	46
	1. <i>Emergence of an International Consortium for the Preservation and Improvement of Cultivars Essential for Food Security</i>	47
	2. <i>Short-Lived Recognition of Plant Genetic Resources as the Common Heritage of Mankind</i>	50
II.	Impinging Intellectual Property Rights Promoted by the Developed Countries	52
A.	<i>Sui Generis</i> Plant Breeders' Rights and Related Biotechnology Patents	53
	1. <i>Strengthened International Protection for Commercial Plant Breeders</i>	53
	2. <i>The Developing Countries Assert Countervailing Proprietary Rights of Their Own</i>	57
B.	Mandatory Protection of Some Microbial-Related Inventions under the TRIPS Agreement of 1994	60
	1. <i>Increasing Reliance on Patents and Trade Secrecy Laws to Protect Commercial Applications of Microbial Genetic Resources</i>	65
	2. <i>Possible Patent Thickets</i>	70
III.	Mounting Impediments to Research Uses of Genetic Resources	72
A.	The Revolt Against the WHO's First Pandemic Influenza Research Commons	75
B.	Implications for the Present Study	78
3	Tightening the Regulatory Grip: From the Convention on Biological Diversity in 1992 to the Nagoya Protocol in 2010	82
I.	Regulatory Measures Controlling Access to Genetic Resources Promoted by the Developing Countries	82
A.	Bioprospecting or Biopiracy?	84

B.	Foundations of an International Regime of Misappropriation to Govern Genetic Resources	87
	1. <i>Indigenous Communities (and Their State Sponsors) as Emerging Stakeholders</i>	87
	2. <i>Access and Benefit Sharing Under the Convention on Biological Diversity</i>	91
C.	Critical Evaluation of the CBD	96
	1. <i>The CBD as an Incomplete International Regime of Misappropriation</i>	97
	2. <i>The Threat to Public Scientific Research on Plant and Microbial Genetic Resources</i>	100
	a. Selected Cases of Alleged Biopiracy Involving Academic Researchers after 1992	100
	b. Major Weaknesses of the “Bilateral Approach”	106
II.	Destabilizing the Exchange of Plant and Microbial Genetic Resources as Global Public Goods	111
A.	The Public Microbial Culture Collections Consider Defensive Options	112
B.	The CGIAR’s Agricultural Research Infrastructure on the Verge of Collapse	115
III.	An International Treaty to Rescue and Expand “The Global Crop Commons”	118
A.	Basic Concepts of the International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture (ITPGRFA)	119
B.	Establishing the Multilateral System for Access and Benefit-Sharing	121
	1. <i>The “Facilitated Access” Regime</i>	123
	2. <i>Notification, Benefit Sharing, and the Standard Material Transfer Agreement</i>	125
C.	Strengths and Weaknesses of the International Treaty on Plant Genetic Resources for Food and Agriculture	130
	1. <i>Demonstrable Achievements</i>	131
	2. <i>Major Weaknesses</i>	135
IV.	New Constraints and Opportunities for Scientific Research Under the Nagoya Protocol	142
A.	Clarifying the Broad Economic Scope of the CBD	146
B.	Facilitating Scientific Research	149
	1. <i>Recognizing the Link Between Public Science and Commercial Benefits</i>	150
	2. <i>Recognizing the Importance of Non-Monetary Benefits</i>	153



C.	Prescriptions for Strict Enforcement of the Newly Codified Regime of Misappropriation	155
V.	Challenging Prospects for the Existing Microbial Research Commons	160

PART TWO PRESERVING THE PUBLIC RESEARCH FUNCTIONS OF MICROBIAL GENETIC RESOURCES AFTER THE NAGOYA PROTOCOL

4	The Existing Microbial Research Commons Confronts Proprietary Obstacles	167
I.	Evolution of Microbial Culture Collections as Basic Scientific Infrastructure	167
A.	The Pivotal Role of the World Federation for Culture Collections	170
1.	<i>Aggregate Holdings and Capacity</i>	171
2.	<i>Servicing the Broad Microbial Research Community</i>	173
3.	<i>The Perennial Problem of Funding</i>	177
B.	From Culture Collections to Biological Resource Centers	179
C.	Beyond the WFCC: Regional and Global Networks of BRCs	186
1.	<i>Disparities Among the WFCC Member Collections</i>	186
a.	Legacy Collections in the European Union and the United States	187
b.	Wide Disparities Among the Collections in Other Regions	191
2.	<i>The Emerging BRC Networks</i>	198
II.	Contractual Restrictions on Access to and Use of Upstream Microbial Genetic Resources in Both Developed and Developing Countries	199
A.	The Advent of a Proprietary Model in Response to Government Neglect in the United States	201
B.	Diffusion of a More Proprietary Approach to Other Public Culture Collections	205
III.	The Research Community Pushes Back	210
A.	Efforts to Negotiate More Research Friendly Material Transfer Agreements	212
1.	<i>The Uniform Biological Material Transfer Agreement in the United States and Its Progeny</i>	212
2.	<i>The Core MTA of the European Culture Collections' Organization</i>	214



3.	<i>The European Commission's Regulation on Access to and Use of Genetic Resources</i>	219
a.	Underlying Premises	220
b.	Basic Concepts and Methods	221
B.	Opting Out or Opting In? Limits of the Trusted Intermediary Approach	225
IV.	From the Bilateral to the Multilateral Approach	231
A.	Basic Concepts of the WHO's Pandemic Infl uenza Preparedness Framework Agreement (2011)	233
B.	Governance and Related Issues	238
C.	Lessons for a Redesigned Microbial Research Commons	241
1.	<i>Trading Downstream Benefits from the Bilateral System for Essential Public Goods</i>	243
2.	<i>Opting into a Multilateral Approach in Order to Stimulate More Downstream Benefits from the Bilateral System</i>	246
5	Facilitating Transnational Exchanges of Genetic Resources within a Redesigned Microbial Research Infrastructure	250
I.	Reconciling Upstream Research Needs with Benefit-Sharing Under the Nagoya Protocol	250
A.	How the Existing Modalities of Exchange Fail the Needs of Scientific Research	250
1.	<i>Social Costs of the Case-by-Case Transactional Approach</i>	251
2.	<i>The Flawed Premise of the Proprietary Ethos</i>	253
3.	<i>Lessons from the Informal Exchange Practices</i>	255
B.	Formalizing the Informal Sector: Premises for a Multilateral Regime of Facilitated Access to Microbial Genetic Resources	257
II.	Designing a Third Option: <i>Ex Ante</i> "Take and Pay" Rules for Stimulating Research and Applications	260
A.	Legal and Economic Foundations of a Compensatory Liability Regime	261
B.	Operational Logic of a Multilateral Common Pool Resource	265
C.	Key Components of the Proposed Multilateral Regime for Facilitated Exchanges of Microbial Genetic Resources	270
1.	<i>Quality Standards as a Threshold Requirement</i>	271
2.	<i>Duty to Respect Reputational Benefits</i>	274
3.	<i>Tracking Mechanisms to Maintain the Chain of Custody</i>	278



4. <i>The Calculus of Royalties from Commercial Applications</i>	284
5. <i>An Enabling Governance Structure</i>	289
III. <i>Modeling a Sequence of Hypothetical Transactions</i>	291
A. <i>The Standard Deal in Six Scenarios</i>	292
1. <i>Identifying and Depositing the Microbe</i>	292
2. <i>Collections A and B Join the Proposed Microbial Research Commons</i>	293
3. <i>Microbe RURI 500/OCCI 8000 Elicits Research Interest</i>	295
4. <i>Development of a Commercial Product</i>	297
5. <i>Sales of the Product Trigger the Liability Rule and Distribution of Royalties</i>	299
6. <i>Lottery Effects and the Possibility of Leakage</i>	302
a. <i>Multiple Industrial Users of the Same Microbe Produce Multiple Royalty Streams</i>	303
b. <i>Addressing the Possibility of Leakage</i>	304
B. <i>Accommodating More Complicated Transactions</i>	307
1. <i>Multiple Owners and Possible Royalty Stacking</i>	307
2. <i>Derivatives or Modifications that Incorporate Materials Accessed from the Multilateral System</i>	309
3. <i>Modifications Based on Data Pertaining to Microbial Materials Accessed from the Multilateral System</i>	310
C. <i>Advantages of the Scheme</i>	312

**PART THREE A DIGITALLY INTEGRATED INFRASTRUCTURE
FOR MICROBIAL DATA AND INFORMATION**

6 Legal and Institutional Obstacles Impeding Access to and Use of Scientific Literature and Data	319
I. Potentially Boundless Scientific Opportunities in the Digital Environment	319
II. Copyright and Related Laws as Digital Gridlock	324
A. Two Conceptual Approaches in the Application of Copyright Law to Science	326
1. <i>Harmonizing the Designated Limitations and Exceptions that Weakly Defend Science in the European Union</i>	328
2. <i>Limits of the Fair Use Approach in the United States</i>	330
B. Digital Locks and Contractual Overrides in the Online Environment	334



C.	Exclusive Rights in Noncopyrightable Collections of Data	336
III.	Automated Knowledge Discovery Tools as Instruments of Massive Infringements	342
A.	What Digital Science Would Really Need from Any Serious Legislative Reform	344
1.	<i>A Tailor-Made Exception for Scientific Research</i>	345
2.	<i>Breaking the Digital Locks</i>	346
3.	<i>Disciplining Contractual Overrides</i>	349
4.	<i>Aligning Database Protection Laws with Tailor-Made Exceptions for Science in Copyright Law</i>	351
5.	<i>Adjusting the International Legal Framework to Accommodate the Needs of Science</i>	352
B.	The Hard Reality: More, Not Less Protection, Is On the Way	355
IV.	Institutional Constraints on Digital Knowledge Resources	357
A.	The Changing Role of Publishing Intermediaries	357
B.	Impediments to the Pooling of Data and Digitally Networked Collaboration	362
V.	Final Observations	367
A.	Bridging the Disconnect Between Private Rights and Public Science	368
B.	Reconciling the Goals of Innovation Policy with the Needs of Science Policy	370
C.	Towards a Digitally Integrated Infrastructure for Microbial Literature and Data	371
7	Enabling the Microbial Research Community to Control Its Own Scholarly Publications	373
I.	Response of the Scientific Community to Restrictions on Published Research Results	373
II.	Surveying the Practices of the Microbial Journals	375
A.	Contractual Provisions of Selected Leading Journals	378
B.	Results of the Broader Survey	380
1.	<i>A Growing Number of Open Access Microbiology Journals</i>	382
2.	<i>Self-Archiving by Authors Who Publish in Subscription Journals</i>	388
3.	<i>Disposition of Copyrights</i>	389
4.	<i>Costs of the Open-Access Option</i>	390
5.	<i>Postscript</i>	391

III.	Redefining the Role of Publishing Intermediaries under Current Institutional Constraints	393
A.	Reflections on the Law Journal Model	396
B.	Funders' Ability to Contractually Regulate Access to, Use, and Reuse of Scientific Literature	399
C.	Integrating Intermediaries' Functions into Transnational Digital Knowledge Environments	402
8	Fully Exploiting Data-Intensive Research Opportunities in the Networked Environment	406
I.	Early Release Policies to Manage the Deluge of Genomic Reference Data	406
A.	The Bermuda, Fort Lauderdale and Toronto Data Policy Guidelines	409
B.	Online Aggregators of Data and Information about Microbial Materials Available from Public Culture Collections	412
	1. <i>Selected Examples of Compliance in the Field of Microbiology</i>	414
	2. <i>The International Human Microbiome Consortium</i>	415
	3. <i>Evaluating the Trend</i>	419
II.	Beyond Early Release: Diverse Networked Sharing Strategies to Manage and Exploit the Deluge of Data	421
A.	Selected Taxonomic and Related Microbiological Reference Data Collections	422
B.	Online Aggregators of Data and Information about Microbial Materials in Public Culture Collections	425
	1. <i>The World Data Center for Microorganisms</i>	426
	2. <i>The StrainInfo Biportal</i>	429
C.	Understanding the Data Sharing Movement and Its Future Potential	431
	1. <i>Benefits and Drawbacks of the Data Sharing Ethos</i>	433
	a. The Public Goods Approach	434
	(1) <i>Benefits</i>	435
	(2) <i>Disadvantages</i>	436
	b. The Quasi-Private Goods Approach	437
	2. <i>Beyond the Public Versus Private Distinction</i>	440
III.	Building Transnational Open Knowledge Environments	441
A.	Examples of Incipient Open Knowledge Environments on the Frontiers of Microbiology	441

1. <i>The Genomic Standards Consortium (GSC) – Interactive Portal and Open Access Journal</i>	441
2. <i>The Community Cyber-Infrastructure for Advanced Marine Microbial Ecology Research and Analysis (CAMERA)</i>	445
3. <i>The System Biology Knowledgebase (KBase) of the U.S. Department of Energy</i>	447
4. <i>The Program on Microbiology of the BUILT Environment (MoBe)</i>	451
B. <i>The Future of Open Knowledge Environments</i>	453
1. <i>Lessons from the Empirical Models</i>	453
2. <i>Operationalizing the Core Concepts</i>	456
a. <i>Licensing Data and Tools</i>	458
b. <i>Benefits of Integrating the Microbial Literature</i>	462
3. <i>Funding and Other Governance Considerations</i>	465
C. <i>Linking the Open Knowledge Environment to the Materials Infrastructure</i>	467

**PART FOUR GOVERNING PUBLIC KNOWLEDGE ASSETS WITHIN
A REDESIGNED MICROBIAL RESEARCH COMMONS**

9 Institutional Models for a Transnational Research Commons	473
I. Theoretical Reflections on Designing a Knowledge Commons	476
A. Applying Commons Theory to Microbial Research Infrastructure	480
1. <i>Distinctive Characteristics of Genetic Materials as a Common Pool Resource</i>	484
2. <i>Factoring in the Unprecedented Power of Digital Networks</i>	486
3. <i>Potential Payoffs from a Well-Designed Governance Model</i>	489
B. Three Governance Prototypes for Globally Pooled Research Assets	492
II. Selected Empirically Relevant Governance Approaches	494
A. The Global Crop Commons: A Treaty-Based Intergovernmental Entity	496
1. <i>A Two-Headed Governance Construct</i>	496
2. <i>Implementation of the Multilateral Regime</i>	499
a. <i>The Viral License</i>	499
b. <i>The Digital Component</i>	501

c. Long-Term Funding Arrangements	502
d. Compliance and Dispute Settlement	504
B. Hybrid Pooling Arrangements Among Governments, Para-Statal Entities, and Nongovernmental Stakeholders	504
1. <i>The World Federation for Culture Collections (WFCC)</i>	505
a. Objectives and Membership	505
b. Governance	507
c. Funding	508
d. Future Prospects: The WFCC at a Turning Point	509
2. <i>The Global Biodiversity Information Facility (GBIF)</i>	510
a. Objectives and Membership	510
b. Governance	511
c. Funding	512
d. Intellectual Property Policies	513
e. Future Prospects	514
3. <i>The Group on Earth Observations (GEO)</i>	514
a. Objectives and Membership	514
b. Governance	516
c. Funding	517
d. Intellectual Property Policies	517
e. Future Prospects	518
4. <i>The International Human Microbiome Consortium (IHMC)</i>	519
a. Objectives and Membership	519
b. Governance	521
c. Funding	522
d. Data and Intellectual Property Policies	523
e. Future Prospects	525
C. The Market-Like Nongovernmental Enterprise	526
1. <i>The Global Biological Resource Centers Network (GBRCN) Demonstration Project</i>	528
a. Objectives and Membership	528
b. Proposed Governance Structure	532
c. Funding and the Business Model	533
2. <i>A Questionable Blueprint for the Future</i>	538
3. <i>Next Step: The Microbial Resource Infrastructure (MIRRI) as a European Stepping Stone to the GBRCN</i>	541
III. In Search of a Politically Acceptable and Scientifically Productive Operational Framework	544
A. Evaluating the Existing Legal and Institutional Landscape	544
1. <i>Comparing Science-Managed NGOs with a Treaty-Based IGO</i>	545

2. <i>Advantages of a Hybrid International Framework Agreement</i>	550
B. Reconciling National Sovereignty over Microbial Genetic Resources with a Global Public Goods Approach	554
1. <i>Avoiding the Wrong Incentives</i>	555
2. <i>Facilitated Access to Upstream Research Assets and Benefit-Sharing Under a Multilateral System</i>	560
C. Toward a More Science-Driven Organizational Model for the Digital Age	563
1. <i>Avoiding an Unduly Narrow Scientific Mission</i>	564
2. <i>Giving Scientists a Voice in the Decision-Making Process</i>	566
10 Governing Digitally Integrated Genetic Resources, Data and Literature	568
I. Premises for Constructing a Common Pool Resource	568
A. The Political Economy of a Global Approach	568
B. The Critical Role of Effective Leadership	574
C. The Need for Political Cover	576
II. Organizational and Structural Considerations	579
A. Membership and Decision Making	581
B. Ancillary Membership Issues	585
C. Observer Status	587
D. The Core Institutional Components	589
1. <i>A Governing Body and an Executive Committee</i>	591
2. <i>A Scientific Coordination Council (SCC) and a Small Secretariat</i>	593
3. <i>Advisory Committees</i>	597
III. Implementing the Multilateral Regime for Facilitated Access to <i>Ex Situ</i> Microbial Genetic Resources	598
A. Promoting and Certifying Quality Standards	599
B. Defining the Conditions of Legitimate Exchange	601
C. Drafting an SMTA to Establish the Compensatory Liability Regime: The Critical Issues	603
1. <i>The Question of a Users' Surcharge</i>	605
2. <i>Quantum and Duration of Royalties</i>	607
3. <i>Protocols for the Distribution of Royalties</i>	609
4. <i>New Uses of Pre-1992 Microbial Materials</i>	613
5. <i>Genetic Sequences and Other Related Data</i>	614
6. <i>Prescribing Minimum Conditions of Reciprocity</i>	615



7. <i>Mediation and Dispute Resolution</i>	618
8. <i>Recognizing the Importance of Nonmonetary Benefits</i>	622
D. Digitally Integrating Knowledge Assets Available from the Multilateral System	624
1. <i>The Core Project</i>	624
2. <i>Optional Longer Term Projects</i>	628
E. Relations with Developing Countries	628
F. Other Issues for the Governing Body to Consider	632
1. <i>Devising Policies for Earlier Release of Materials Used in Basic Research</i>	632
2. <i>Possible Negotiations Concerning Access to In Situ Microbial Genetic Resources</i>	634
3. <i>Biosafety and Security Considerations</i>	635
IV. Funding and Institutional Stability	637
A. The Need for Adequate and Dependable Funding	637
B. Hidden Costs of Not Funding a Redesigned Microbial Research Commons	642
V. Concluding Observations	645
<i>Index</i>	651

